Week 8: The doctrine of sin

- Dietrich Bonhoeffer, *Creation and Fall*, in *Works*, vol. 3, trans. Douglas Stephan Bax, ed. John W. de Gruchy (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2004).
- Derek R. Nelson, What's Wrong with Sin: Sin in Individual and Social Perspective from Schleiermacher to Theologies of Liberation (London: T&T Clark, 2009).
- Reinhold Niebuhr, *The Nature and Destiny of Man: A Christian Interpretation* (London: Nisbet & Co., 1941–3).
- Ted Peters, Sin: Radical Evil in Soul and Society (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1994).

1. Introduction

- Doctrine of sin is deeply ambiguous.
- One the one hand: close to the heart of Christian theology.
- On the other hand, gives rise to reserve and criticism.
- Stands for denial of human goodness.
- Legitimised draconian discipline.
- Both sides of the doctrine need explaining.

2. Biblical perspectives

- Doctrine of sin largely NT teaching although reliant on OT texts.
- E.g. Ps. 32, 1–2: Blessed are those whose iniquities are forgiven, and whose sins are covered; blessed is the one against whom the Lord will not reckon sin.
- Quoted in Romans 4, 7-8.
- Important: for NT sin comes into view in the context of forgiveness, redemption.

Biblical Perspectives II

- (a) Forgiveness of sins.
- Predominant theme in synoptic gospels.
- John the Baptist preaches 'baptism of repentance for the forgiveness of sins' (Mk 1, 4; Lk 3, 3).
- 'Healing of a paralytic' in Mk 2:
- 5. When Jesus saw their faith, he said to the paralytic, 'Son, your sins are forgiven.'
- Sin always used in the plural refers to individual acts.
- Forgiveness before death and resurrection of Jesus.

Biblical perspectives III

- (b) Sin in the Gospel of John
- Important theme, but word almost always used in singular:
- 1, 29: 'The Lamb of God who takes away the sin of the world!' (John the Baptist about Jesus)
- Sin here is a cosmic force.
- Connection with Jesus' sacrificial death ('lamb of God').

Biblical perspectives III

- (c) Sin as universal
- Most influential on sin is St Paul.
- Rm 3, 9: 'All are under the power of sin'.
- Emphasis on sin's universal sway (note singular again).
- Affects everyone Jews and Greeks.
- Is *only* and *fully* annulled in Christ's death.

Biblical perspectives IV

- (d) Adam and Christ
- Rm 5, 12: 'Just as sin came into the world through one man, and death came through sin ...'
- Interpretation of the fall story of Gen. 3 as 'original sin'.
- Connection of sin and death.
- Universal sin universal redemption?

Biblical perspectives V

- The Bible speaks of sin a lot!
- 2. Sin is spoken of in diverse ways, even just in the NT.
- 3. Synoptics emphasise individual transgressions, *sins* (plural), whereas John and Paul think of sin (singular) as a universal, cosmic force.
- 4. All correlate it with Jesus' redemptive activity: his ministry (synoptics) and his death/resurrection.
- 5. Important: sin is merely the foil for the gospel of salvation.

3. Sin as personal and universal

- Sin is naturally aligned with misdeeds.
- We tend to think of a sinner as a criminal or an amoral person.
- Forgiveness of sins amount to a willingness to 'move on' after someone has done us a wrong.
- Evidently, this usage isn't compatible with the biblical witness.
- Sin cannot simply be identical with moral/criminal fault even though it is clearly related.

Sin as personal and universal II

- Is sin then an external force that *makes* us bad or turns good intentions into bad outcomes?
- Undoubtedly, human beings experience this kind of predicament (cf. Greek tragedy).
- 'The sin of the world' (Jn 1, 29) seems to be related to this experience.
- Yet: sin must *also* be personal, or forgiveness would make little sense.
- In some sense they are 'our' sins.

4. Sin and interiority

- Sin is most plausibly connected with innermost core of our humanity.
- In NT already emphasis is more on *motivations* than actual actions (cf. the 'hypocritical' Pharisees, Paul's use of 'coveting' in Rm. 7, 7 ff.).
- Augustine: 'Sin is nowhere but in the will' (De duabus animabus 10)
- Sin is a disposition to action, not the action itself.
- Hence, it can be universal while our actions are not determined.

Sin and interiority

- Augustine: Sin is concupiscence.
- The structure of our desire is problematic.
- Gen. 3, 5: 'You will be like God'.
- But: Augustine identified concupiscence with *sexual* desire in particular.
- We inherit Adam's sin insofar as we are conceived in lust.
- Dark side of doctrine of sin coming to the fore.

5. Universal and original sin

- Pelagian controversy: perhaps most influential for Western theology.
- Pelagius (390–418) taught moral and ascetic Christianity.
- Christians are told in the Bible to do good; therefore they are able to do so.
- They have free will and will be held responsible by God for their moral and spiritual perfection.
- Against Pelagius, Augustine emphasized the universality of grace and sin.

Universal and original sin II

- To advance his case, Augustine developed theory of original sin.
- Adam's sin is passed on to all human beings in two ways.
- (1) All inherit his propensity to sin.
- (2) All share in his guilt because 'in him' all sinned (on basis of flawed reading of Rm 5, 12).
- All humanity is a massa perditionis (mass of perdition).
- Deserving of punishment and thus saved only by grace.

Universal and original sin III

- The notion that human being 'inherit' Adam's guilt is powerful.
- It can solve the problem of theodicy: The existence of moral and natural evil can be traced back to Adam's sin.
- It explains the *universality* of sin and the need for salvation.
- Justifies infant baptism (not even an infant is free from sin).
- Yet it is also terrifying and seemingly far removed from the gospel of love.

6. Sin and law

- Jewish teaching on Torah insists it is God's good gift to his chosen people.
- Yet St Paul understands it (in Greek) as 'law' and contrasts it with the gospel.
- No salvation is possible 'through works of the law' (e.g. Rm 3, 20).
- Why then was it given by God?
- Paul's response: because of sin (Gal. 3, 19).

Sin and law II

- The law therefore was a 'disciplinarian' before the salvation through Christ.
- The correlation of sin and law in Paul facilitates a punitive conception of law.
- Luther, Commentary on Galatians (1531): 'God has ordained civic laws, indeed all laws, to restrain transgressions. [...] Restraint from sins is not righteousness but rather an indication of unrighteousness. Therefore just as a rope holds a furious and untamed beast and keeps it from attacking whatever it meets, so the Law constrains an insane and furious man lest he commit further sins.' Luther Works 26, 308.

Sin and law III

- There are at least two 'uses' of the law:
- 1. The 'political' or 'civic' use.
- 2. The 'elenchtic' use, cf. Rm 3, 20: 'through the law comes the knowledge of sin'.
- Melanchthon and Calvin teach also a 'third use' of the law which is pedagogical for Christians.
- The alignment of sin and law increases the dark aspect of the doctrine of sin.

7. Sin and existence

- Most influential in 19th and 20th century theology has been an existential interpretation of sin.
- S. Kierkegaard: The Concept of Anxiety (1844).
- Kierkegaard identifies sin with the existential shock of human beings faced with their infinite possibilities.
- We get our lives wrong, so to speak, because we can't accept our finitude.
- Although formulated as a critique of Augustine's teaching, Kierkegaard's theory preserves its core elements.

Sin and existence II

- Sin is a determination of human existence that prevents us from fulfilling our potential *as* finite beings.
- As such, it is the root of particular sins but not identical with them.
- It is also, plausibly, inescapable apart from redemption.
- This idea was picked up by major 20th century theologians, e.g. Barth, Tillich, and Bonhoeffer.

8. Open questions

- Individual sin structural sin:
- Liberation theology has rightly insisted that sin cannot be applied to individual existence but applies to social/political structures as well.
- Gendered sin:
- Feminism insists that traditional hamartology emphasizes 'male' sins which for women may be virtues.
- Both critiques remind us that discourse on sin occurs in specific cultural context by which it is tinged.